

IMAMAH AND WILAYAH¹

PART V

MOHAMMAD ALI SHOMALI

ABSTRACT: Having a leader and a guide who draws people nearer to righteousness is a blessing and grace of God. The concept of Imamate in Shi'i Islam deems it necessary to have a guide who will lead the Muslim society after the Prophet's death by presenting true Islam as well as being a political leader. This guide is appointed by God and possesses qualities of piety, knowledge, wisdom, and infallibility. Part IV of this series verified that the Shi'a understanding of Imamate is compatible with the Qur'an in that God refers to Himself as having rule, governance, sovereignty, and the power to choose, and people are asked to obey Him, the Prophet, and those "*vested with authority among the people*" (i.e. the infallibles). This part studies the group of verses that refer to the profound concept of *witness*, including his roles and qualities. According to these verses, there must be a witness amongst every generation of people. The Qur'an indicates that the witness who followed Prophet Muhammad (s) was from him and had knowledge of the Book; these qualities can only be found in Imam Ali (a).

¹ This paper is based on lecture 12 of a series of lectures delivered by Dr Mohammad Ali Shomali in summer 2004 in Qum.

As described in the previous part, in the Qur'an, God refers to Himself as having rule (*amr*), governance (*hukm*), full sovereignty (*mulk*), and the power to choose (*ikhtiyār*). He is our guardian (*wali*) and He is to be obeyed (*tā'ah*). These attributes ascertain His sole power to choose and legitimize a leader, because He gives it to whomever He pleases. People are asked to obey Him, the Prophet, and those “*vested with authority among the people*” i.e. the infallibles. These verses without a doubt verify that the Shi'a understanding of Imamate is compatible with the Qur'an.

Part I: The Concept of Witness in the Qur'an

According to the Qur'an, the most outstanding groups of people are those whom the people upon whom God has bestowed His blessings, and every Muslim at least ten times a day in his prayers asks God to guide him towards their path, the Right Path (1:6 & 7). These groups are four:

All who obey God and the messenger are in the company of those on whom is the Grace of God, - of the prophets (who teach), the most truthful, the witnesses (who testify), and the Righteous (who do good): Ah! what a beautiful Fellowship! (4:69)

Thus, the witnesses come in rank in line with the prophets and the most truthful. Indeed, many witnesses were Prophets and all witnesses were undoubtedly truthful. Several verses in the Qur'an refer to who these witnesses are:

One Day We shall raise from all Peoples a Witness: then will no excuse be accepted from Unbelievers, nor will they receive any favours. (16:84)

On the Day of Judgement, when all nations will be brought before Allah, a witness will come from each nation; hence, there is no nation without someone acting as a witness over them. This witness points

out the right way and will testify that that divine message was clearly conveyed to all peoples, in addition to the divine signs witnessed in nature. There will then be no room for any excuses. For this reason, the Qur'an says: "*No excuse will be accepted from Unbelievers, nor will they receive any favours.*" The Qur'an also says:

So how shall it be, when We bring from every nation a witness and We bring you as a witness to them? (4:41)

One day We shall raise from all Peoples a witness against them, from amongst themselves: and We shall bring thee as a witness against these (thy people): and We have sent down to thee the Book explaining all things, a Guide, a Mercy, and Glad Tidings to Muslims. (16:89)

Thus, the Qur'an clearly indicates that a witness must be a human being from amongst the people themselves, a witness who understood them and was known to them. This verse also confirms that the Prophet Muḥammad (s) will be witness against the people who lived during his mission. He will be a witness against those who believed in him and the Book he brought, and against those who rejected him and his message.

The roles of a witness

The roles and characteristics of witnesses are as follows:

-God's Hujjah

Although *hujjah* is often translated as a proof or argument, it technically means something or someone that helps you to understand the will of God. Anything or anyone that can be trusted in understanding the will of God or any person is a *hujjah*. A *Hujjah* can be used by people to defend their position if they have acted according to him. On the Day of Judgment, both Allah and His servants refer to

the *hujjah*. Allah asks and judges us according to the *hujjah* He provided us with.

The main *hujjah* are our intellect ('*aql*) and the Prophets (a) who have received divine message for mankind through revelation. Since there must be a *hujjah* in each age, the Imams are a *hujjah* after Prophet Muhammad.

Thus, the witnesses are people who can be taken as a *hujjah*. By looking at them and considering what they do and say, you can have good *hujjah* to justify your conduct. For example, Allah says:

The day He will call out to them and say, 'Where are My partners that you used to claim'? We shall draw from every nation a witness and say, 'Produce your evidence'. Then they will know that all reality belongs to God and what they used to fabricate will forsake them. (28:74 & 75)

When Allah asks people regarding what they did and failed to do, He chooses one of them as a witness and asks him to give an account of a) what they were *expected* to believe and practice, and b) what they *actually* believed and practiced. In this way, the faults of the wrongdoers and those who have gone astray will be exposed. Thus, the role of a witness is that he serves as a standard in this world and hereafter.

-A witness confirms those who lie against Allah

On the Day of Judgment, the witnesses will confirm those who denied the signs of Allah and attributed lies to Him:

Who doth more wrong than those who invent a lie against God. They will be turned back to the presence of their Lord, and the witnesses will say, "These are the ones who lied against their Lord! Behold! the Curse of God is on those who do wrong! (Hud, 18)

Allah says that on the Day of Judgement for both those who have denied divine communications and told lies the witnesses will report the lies they attributed to their Lord.

-A witness protects the Divine Book

Another task of witnesses is to protect the Divine Books:

We sent down the Torah containing guidance and light. The prophets, who had submitted, judged by it for the Jews, and so did the rabbis and the scribes, as they were charged to preserve the Book of God and were witnesses to it. So do not fear the people, but fear Me, and do not sell My signs for a paltry gain. Those who do not judge by what God has sent down—it is they who are the faithless. (5:44)

The Prophets who have submitted themselves to Allah ruled or judged the Jews according to the Torah. Afterwards, Allah speaks of the people who were given the task of preserving the Torah - “*to them was entrusted the protection of God’s book and they were witnesses thereto.*” These people were witnesses upon the Torah: If the Torah was distorted, they will testify on the Day of Judgment as to whether they dutifully maintained the book, or deliberately destroyed it.

Note: Some non-Shi‘a scholars assert that the Prophet (s) was the witness against people of his time and all the future generations until end of this world. However, it can be understood from the Qur’an itself that a witness, in this particular sense, must live with and amongst the people whom he is going to be witness against. According to the Qur’an, when God asks Prophet Jesus (a) whether he told the people to take him and his mother for gods besides God, his answer will be:

I did not say to them [anything] except what You had commanded me [to say] “Worship God, my Lord and your Lord.” And I was a witness to them so long as I was

among them. But when You had taken me away. You Yourself were watchful over them, and You are witness to all things. (5:117)

Although Jesus (a) did not die, his position as a witness continued only as long as he lived among the people and ended when God raised him and took him away. Thus, there is no way to hold that the Prophet (s) was a witness in this sense for the period after his demise. There must have been a witness after him, and that witness must be followed by another witness; and this continues until end of this world.

Part II: Imam Ali as a Witness of God

There are at least two verses (11:17 & 13:43) that clearly indicate that Imam Ali was the witness after the Prophet (s). In what follows, these verses will be examined.

Imam Ali was a witness from the Prophet ('minhu')

The Qur'an says:

Can they be (like) those who accept a Clear (Sign) from their Lord, and whom a witness from Himself doth teach, as did the Book of Moses before it, - a guide and a mercy? They believe therein; but those of the Sects that reject it, - the Fire will be their promised meeting-place. Be not then in doubt thereon: for it is the truth from thy Lord: yet many among men do not believe! (11:17)

The sentence "*Can they be (like) those who accept a Clear (Sign) from their Lord*" clearly refers to the Prophet since he who possesses a manifest proof from His Lord. The line "*...and whom a witness from Himself doth teach*" must then refer to someone who is a witness from the Prophet, although he is not the Prophet himself given the word *minhu* (*from himself*).² Indeed, he comes after (*yatlū*) the Prophet.

² The word *minhu* (*from him*) has also been used in the Prophet's hadith regarding Imam Husayn: "Husayn is from me and I am from Husayn."

This person is none other than Imam Ali. The verse of *Mubāhala* and the chapter *The Immunity (Barā'a)* attest that Imam Ali was he who was *from* the Prophet (*minhu*).

a) *The Event of Mubahala*

The Event of Mubāhala occurred between the Christians of Najran and Prophet Muhammad on the 10th of Hijrah. When the people of Najran deified Jesus, the Prophet called for a *Mubahalāh* – a meeting in which both sides gather their men, women, and children to pray to God and invoke a curse on those who lie:

If any one disputes in this matter with thee, now after (full) knowledge hath come to thee, say: 'Come! let us gather together, - our sons and your sons, our women and your women, ourselves and yourselves: Then let us earnestly pray, and invoke the curse of God on those who lie!' (3:61)

The Prophet took Imam Hasan and Husayn as “*our sons*,” Lady Fatima as “*our women*,” and Imam Ali as “*ourselves*.” Imam Ali clearly does not fit into the category of “*our sons*” and “*our women*” which means he must have been from “*ourselves*.” Furthermore, no one can claim to be closer to the Prophet than Imam Ali, and he was the sole person qualified enough to represent the Prophet. Sunni scholars likewise agree that those whom the Prophet summoned are none other than Ali, Fatima, Hasan, and Husayn.³

b) *Declaration of the Chapter Barā'a*

The Prophet was ordered to reveal the chapter *Barā'a (The Immunity)* in condemnation to the unbelievers and polytheists. This involved prohibiting them from entering Masjid ul-Haram⁴ and asserting that a person cannot enter heaven without being a believer. Additionally,

³ *Sahih Muslim: The Book of Merits* in “The Merits of Imam Ali”; *Sunan of Tirmidhi* no. 3085

⁴ The Grand Mosque that surrounds the Ka'ba in Mecca.

those who entered were no longer permitted to circumambulate the Ka'ba unclothed as this was one of their previous customs.

The Prophet first asked Abu Bakr to deliver it to the people of Mecca. When Abu Bakr set out, he left for a short time until the Prophet instructed Imam Ali to reach Abu Bakr and ask him to return and to deliver the message himself. The difficulty of being asked to turn back brought Abu Bakr to tears as he supposed that perhaps Allah has revealed something against him personally and thus ordered the Prophet to send him back. The Prophet informed him that there was nothing about him personally, telling him that it was due to a special command of Allah that no one should communicate this to the people except him or a man from him.⁵

The event of *Mubahala* and the revelation of the chapter *Barā'a* verify that the caliphs were not regarded as *from* the Prophet (*minhu*) apart from Imam Ali. Thus, when Allah says, "a witness from himself follows him" in verse 11:17, this can only refer to Imam Ali.

Imam Ali was the witness who followed the Prophet and had knowledge of the Book

The following verse also confirms Imam Ali (a) as the witness after Prophet Muhammad:

*The Unbelievers say: "No messenger art thou" Say:
"Enough for a witness between me and you is God, and
such as have knowledge of the Book." (13:43)*

⁵ *Musnad* of Imam Ahmad ibn Hanbal; *Sunan* of Tirmidhi; *Mustadrak* of Saheehayn. Original texts in Arabic are as follows:

«إِنَّ النَّبِيَّ بَعَثَهُ بِبِرَاءَةِ إِلَى أَهْلِ مَكَّةَ، فَسَارَ ثَلَاثًا ثُمَّ قَالَ لِعَلِيٍّ: الْحَقُّ، فَرَدَّ عَلِيُّ أَبُو بَكْرٍ وَيَنْفَعُهَا، فَلَمَّا قَدِمَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (ص) قَالَ: يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ حَدِّثْ فَيَ شَيْءٍ، قَالَ: مَا وَجَدْتُ فِيكَ إِلَّا خَيْرًا، لَكِنِّي أَمَرْتُ أَنْ لَا يُبَلِّغَ إِلَّا أَنَا أَوْ رَجُلٌ مِنِّي...»

Ahmad ibn Hanbal, *Musnad* (Beirut: Dār Sādir), vol. 1, p. 3. See also *Sahih* of Tirmidhi, vol. 5, p. 594.

روى أنَّ أبا بكر لما كان ببعض الطريق - أي لتبليغ سورة براءة - هبط جبرائيل (عليه السلام)، فقال: «يا محمد: لا يبلغن رسالتك إلا رجلاً منك، فأرسل علياً...»

Zamakhshari, Jarullah, *Al-Kashshāf* (Beirut: 1987, Dār ak-Kitāb al-'Arabi), vol. 2, p. 243.

This verse clearly indicates that in addition to God, there was a witness between Prophet Muhammad and the unbelievers who is introduced as the one who had knowledge of the Book. This question becomes extremely important if we reflect on the fact that there is a great difference between having knowledge of the Book (*'ilmul-kitāb*) and *some* knowledge of the Book (*'ilmun minal-kitāb*). According to the Qur'an, having some knowledge of the Book enabled Asif ibn Barkhiyā to bring the throne of the Queen of Saba' to Prophet Solomon (a) in a twinkling of an eye:

The one who had knowledge of the Book said, 'I will bring it to you in the twinkling of an eye.' So when he saw it set near him, he said, 'This is by the grace of my Lord, to test me if I will give thanks or be ungrateful. And whoever gives thanks, gives thanks only for his own sake. (27:40)

If this is what a person who has some knowledge of the Book can do, one can only imagine the ability of a person who has all the knowledge of the Book. Who was the one who had knowledge of the Book other than God and the Prophet and was therefore qualified to be a witness between the Prophet and the people of his time?

Apart from the Prophet, Imam Ali undoubtedly outshined everyone in his wisdom, knowledge, and intelligence. The Prophet said, "The most knowledgeable person in my nation after me is Ali."⁶ The Prophet lay emphasis on heeding to Imam Ali given his sophistication and intellect. He said, "I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its gate. Whoever wants to enter this city must first pass through its gate."⁷ Indeed, Imam Ali is a role model for those who possess an ardent desire to live and die like the Prophet, and eventually dwell in Paradise:

⁶ *Manaqib al-Imam Ali ibn Abi Talib* of Ibn al-Maghazeli al-Shafi'i

⁷ *Sahih al-Tirmidhi*, v5, pgs. 201, 637; *al-Mustadrak* by al-Hakim, v3, pgs. 126-127, 226; *Fada'il al-Sahaba* by Ahmad ibn Hanbal, v2, p. 635, tradition # 1081 [as seen in *A Shi'ite Encyclopedia*]; *Mustadrak ul Sahihayn* vol. 3 p. 163.

Whoever becomes glad and happy with a life like my life and with a death like my death and with dwelling in the everlasting paradise of my Lord, loves Ali and considers him as his guardian (*wali*), loves the lover of Ali, and follows my household after me, because they are my progeny, they have been created from my clay, and they have been given my knowledge and understanding. Grievous is the one from my nation who denies their merits, and cut the relation between me and them. May God not grant them my intercession.⁸

Given his knowledge and perceptiveness, Imam Ali upholds the mission of protecting the Book. Moreover, his governance is precisely based on the Qur'an, rendering him the sole person to be taken as a standard in understanding Islam and its obligations.

Thus, the one to be taken as a standard in a) understanding Islam, b) understanding what to do, c) upholding the actual task of protecting the Book, and d) judge and rule according to the Book after the Prophet (s) is Imam Ali.

Conclusion

The most outstanding groups of people as said in the Qur'an are the prophets, the truthful, the righteous, and the witnesses. On the Day of Judgment, a witness from each nation who lived with his people and

⁸ *Kanzul Ummal*, vol. 6, p. 155; *Mustadrak* by al-Hākim, vol. 3, p. 128; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 6, p. 155; *Al-Manāqib* by Khawarazmi, p. 34; *Yanābi' al-Mawaddah*, p. 149; *Tārikh* by Ibn 'Asākir, vol. 2, p. 95; *Hilyat al-Awliyā*, vol. 1, p. 86; *Al-Jāmi' al-Kabir* by al Tabrani and *Al-Isābah* by Ibn Hajar. The original text is Arabic is as follows:

«من سره أن يحيا حياتي ، ويموت مماتي ، ويسكن جنة عدن غرسها ربي ، فليوال عليا من بعدي وليوال وليه ، وليقتد بأهل بيتي من بعدي ، فإنهم عترتي خلقوا من طينتي ، ورزقوا فهمي وعلمي ، فويل للمكذابين بفضلمهم من أمتي ، الفاطعين فيهم صلتي ، لا أنالهم الله شفاعتي.»

It should be noted that unfortunately some Sunni writers have tried to question the authenticity of this hadith. For example, Ibn Hajar in his *Al-Isābah* questions the chain of narration for this hadith because of weakness of Yahyā ibn 'Ya'lā while both Muslim and Bukhāri have trusted him and narrated hadiths from him. People like *Dhahabi* have also taken his trustworthiness out of question.

revealed the straight path will testify that the divine message was clearly conveyed to all people, thus eliminating any room for excuses. They verify those who denied the signs of God and attributed lies to Him. They also bear the task of protecting the Divine Book. The Prophet Muhammad (s) was a witness for the people who lived during his time, both for those who believed and rejected his message. Another type of witness is our intellect (*'aql*).

Several verses of the Qur'an indicate that after the Prophet's death, Imam Ali bore the responsibility of being a witness amongst his people. In the chapter *Hud*, verse 17, the line "...and whom a witness from Himself doth teach" refers to a witness from the Prophet (*minhu*).

The verse of *Mubāhala*, the chapter *Barā'a*, and the chapter *The Ra'd* attest that this witness - who followed the Prophet and had knowledge of the Book - was none other than Imam Ali.